

Historic Preservation Meeting
May 21, 2019

Voting Commission Members Present:

Greta Chessler, Bill Wilkinson, Connie O'Connell, Katie Greene, Clyde Ensor

Voting Commission Members absent: Dan Fultz, Doug Schmitt

Non-voting Commission Members present: Bill Wetherton, Chairman, Peg Revell, Advisor, Mary Easterling, Recording Clerk

Visitors: Tommy Hewitt, Morgan McGarvey, Amber Elder, Pat Wetherton, Bob Towler, Eric Ison, Brad Michael, Joe Wolf, Barlow Brooks, Cindy Albright Parrish, Don Bauer, Charlie Hawkins, Celia Manlove, Brian Manlove, M. Thurman Sean, Linda Siegrist, Bob Schutz, Hilary Wise, Tony Bayus, Lennie Fulton, Jane Brown, Laura Linkous, David Linkous, Clayton Langon, Ken Hall, Jill Hall, Ricardo Pavez, Chris Compton, Carla Judd, Steve Porter, Nancy Webb, Cara Martin, Emilie Delehanty, Clyde Leff, Da Doering, Meg Smedley, Tracy Haus, Stephanie Montgomery, Matt Delehanty, Jack Martin

The meeting was called to order at 6pm and the minutes from the April 16, 2019 meeting were read and approved with the following addition " Neighbors asked St Luke's to meet and discuss design ideas. St Luke's stated this was not required and declined to meet"

Sub-Committee report: an appointed sub committee met to review revised new home construction plans for the Holton home at 1700 Cold Spring Rd. The COA was approved by appointed committee.

Bill Wetherton reported the Heritage Council turned down funds for possible help in paying CRAI fees for revised HPC guidelines. We are asking for clarification from Heritage Council on their decision. Bill Wetherton will investigate another program that may be available to help fund guidelines this summer. Allen Higgins with CRAI plans to have their preliminary draft to us in June.

Katie Green motioned for an Executive Session to discuss pending litigation. O'Connell seconded the motion. At 6:05 the Commission entered an executive session.

The meeting was called back to order at 6:35pm

New Business

City of Anchorage Fire Station 1306 Evergreen Road

Anchorage Middletown fire and EMS was awarded a federal grant to install a vehicle exhaust system in the fire station. This system captures exhaust and fumes and vents it to the outside through the wall of the fire station. Since the fire station building is inside the historic district they are required approval from the HPC. Bill Wilkinson asked whether the system was a louvered system. The system is louvered and has a 5 inch pipe that will collect exhaust from the two bays. Katie Greene motions to approve the proposal as submitted, Bill Wilkinson seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously with no discussion.

Wenz family 807 Surrey Lane

Don Bauer and Clayton Langon came for the Wenz family for approval of the installation of a Gunite inground swimming pool with pool equipment, fencing and a generator. They stated that you can't see the fence from the Surrey Lane side. There were questions about the placement of the electrical box. LG&E suggested the placement near the house. The next-door neighbor or property owner will landscape their side of the box will limit visibility from their home. Generator will be on another slab next to pool equipment. Katie Greene motioned to approve the proposal with no spikes on the metal fencing. Greta Chessler seconded the motion and the motion approved with no discussion.

Brian Elder 1509 Old Harrods Creek Rd

The Elder family would like to install a 6' privacy fence around the pool. The committee reminded them that fencing facing the street can be a maximum of 4 feet tall according to HPC guidelines. The rest of the fence is regulated by state requirements. Katie Greene stated that HPC prefers a more open fencing option over a solid wood fence. Ensor stated that the fencing does have some movement. The fence sits back behind the house. Clyde Ensor motions to approve the plans with the condition the fence is 4' tall facing the street. Katie Greene seconded the motion. The motion passes with no discussion.

Montgomery 12337 Forrest School Lane

Stephanie Montgomery asked to replace trees with a privacy fence to cover basketball goal, golf cart and garbage cans. The fence will be stone with limestone caps to mimic existing home. The fence will be tall enough to cover garbage cans. Columns could be 7 feet tall but most of fence would be shorter. Brick or stone will be used as materials. Katie Greene approves with brick or stone and limestone cap no taller than 7 feet. She suggests landscaping around the fence. Connie O'Connell seconded the motion. The motion carries unanimously with no discussion.

Mayor Tommy Hewitt spoke to encourage everyone to be cordial. He asks the visitors to respect the volunteers on the HPC committee. He asked guests to make your point succinctly as we move forward.

St Luke's Church 1206 Maple Lane

Eric Ison Lawyer for St Luke's spoke in support of St. Luke's as a resident, parishioner and their lawyer. He urged the commission to make the right decision that is legally appropriate so that St. Luke's can continue in its ministry. There is a court reporter and videographer here tonight so we can take notes if proposal is declined. St. Luke's file is designated beginning June 2018 to date. All documents and drawings from June 2018, February, March, and April 2019, letters, certificate application, site plans, elevation drawings, multiple photos and all other drawings, photos and documents are included tonight in the application. Celia Manlove and Tony Bayus will make the presentation tonight.

Celia Manlove read a message from Father Delk explaining why St. Luke's needs to expand. Father Delk states they need expanded worship space, expand educational space, expanded fellowship space and to add restrooms to serve the core purpose of the church which is to spread the good news of Christ. The church needs space to exercise its purpose. The new building offers new and better facilities and the parishioners are motivated by an act of faith. Bill Wetherton asked for a copy of the letter to be submitted to the city.

Tony Bayus discussed the new submittal. He submits for the record photos showing adjacent properties, photos from the street in the summer and winter, new addition on western side of building, and site drawings. He reviewed St. Luke's history and master plan. Bayus states that this plan started in 2011. The current plan is within the size guidelines that are set by the state of Kentucky. This addition is 6740 square feet. This plan is actually less 4500 ft.² less than is allowed. This plan contains 3370 ft.² on the first floor and 3370 ft.² on the second floor. In May the site plan was resubmitted. Chris Crumpton of Blue Stone Engineers met to set planning requirements through the city of Anchorage. The floor area ratio is within guidelines, the setback is OK; no variance required from adjoining properties. Curbing has been added to the plan. Landscape beds are used to organize parking. Everywhere there is curbing and parking; landscaping is added. Added impervious spaces are minimal and approved by the city of Anchorage. 131 total spaces have been reviewed and approved by the city of Anchorage 52 of which are impervious. The connector adds elevator and movement between buildings. The connector will adjust floor levels between buildings. Gothic shapes on the connector are used

to relate to the original building. Board hall is actually just expanding the existing room and revovating the kitchen. Lower level are education rooms, nursery, restrooms and new larger meeting room that has covered outside access. After June 2018 original proposal was submitted, St. Luke's intentionally delayed resubmittal until site plan was approved. February 2019 a second proposal was submitted in response to feedback from Bill Wetherton and Bill Wilkinson. Wetherton and Wilkinson expressed a preference for plan number five. At the March meeting plan number five was not approved by HPC. St. Luke's reached out to Dan Fultz and new plan prepared. A conversation between Bill Wetherton and Barlow Brooks provides basis for May proposal. Clarification for the May proposal was provided by Bill Wetherton in a letter. Below are letter points and St. Luke's responses.

1. Dryvit - eliminated
2. Stone - primary material
3. Beltline - Stone water table line has always been part of the plan and still is part of the plan.
4. Stucco - real stucco is being used for materials that aren't stone.
5. Slate Roof - going to use faux slate as has been used already on the church. Using a faux product with good longevity.
6. Windows - same windows as submitted in June. Configuration and materials match existing windows.
7. Cornice and rake details - these details will match existing trim conditions on existing building.
8. Arches - Stone arch is above last supper window will remain. Second arch on entrance canopy will match what is on the main Maple Lane entrance.
9. Soften West bump out - reduced from 10' to 6'
10. Canopy entrance - added back to current plan with modifications.
11. North facade - added to plan submitted tonight.

Re-cap of changes: elements match, trim matches, stone matches, windows match, relocated window, gable element behind Dudley Hall scaled down in respect to history of the building. Now building is broken down to smaller forms to scale back the mass. All appropriate elements presented tonight accomplish the goals of St. Luke's. St. Luke's believe they have gone above and beyond what is necessary for this process and are in compliance.

Attorney Steve Porter asked to speak on behalf of opposition. Steve read a letter stating opposition from neighbors. His clients oppose the mass of the building and believe there should be another way to accomplish St. Luke's goals. He reminded HPC members to not be intimidated by possible litigation. Asked HPC to deny the application. Carla Judd doesn't believe St. Luke's is invisible from Owl Creek Lane. Tony Bayus says from Maple and Owl Creek Lane you could look back and see the church but not before Maple Lane. Meg Smedley says the St. Luke's church addition is completely visible from her property. She is concerned about safety for her kids. Eric Ison asks the Commission if St. Luke's has met the requirements set forth by HPC. Katie Greene thanked everyone who presented tonight and thanked everyone in attendance. She stated the commission takes its role very seriously. She stated accordingly and pursuant to section 152.15 of the ordinances for the city of Anchorage that require that the commission seek expert advise when this Commission reviews an issue that is normally evaluated by a professional member and that field is not represented on the Commission this evening. Greene moved that the Commission consider the evidence presented tonight and vote when at least one architect or consultant can be present either at a special meeting called pursuant to our ordinances or at the next regularly scheduled meeting on June 18, 2019. Connie O'Connell seconded. Jack Martin stated that there are no renderings showing adjacent homes which would be helpful for the HPC members to understand the impact of the addition on adjacent properties. The motion passed unanimously with no discussion.

Clyde Ensor made a motion to adjourn Greta Chessler seconded.

The meeting adjourned at 8:30pm

Submitted by Mary Easterling- recording clerk